

**Canadian National Debate Championships  
Annual General Meeting  
Glenlyon-Norfolk School, Victoria, BC  
Saturday-Sunday April 24-25, 2010**

**1. Call to Order**

John Robinson, in lieu of John Baty as Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:10 am.

In Attendance:

**Board of Governors**

\*\*\*John Robinson, Manitoba (Chair)  
\*Linda Martin, Manitoba  
\*\*Harold Kyte, Nova Scotia  
\*Josh Judah, Nova Scotia  
\*\*\*Lorelie DeRoose, Saskatchewan  
(secretary)

Regrets:

John Baty, British Columbia (Host)  
Kirsten Wyndham-West, Ontario

**Provincial Voting Members**

\*\*Brian Casey, Nova Scotia  
\*\*Gregory Loudon, Quebec  
\*\*Angela Fraser, Alberta  
\*\*\*Tracey Lee, British Columbia  
(also held John Baty's vote)  
\*\*Katrine Doganoglu, Ontario

**Also in attendance**

Kathleen Butler, Nova Scotia  
Christina Grivas, Quebec  
Darka Burczynski, Manitoba  
Rhonda Smith, Manitoba

**2. Adoption of the Agenda**

**Brian Casey/Josh Judah moved adoption of the Agenda. Carried.**

**3. Adoption of the 2009 Minutes**

The minutes were not formally adopted by the membership.

**4. Report on the 2010 Championships**

On behalf of the attendees, John Robinson called for a vote of thanks to John Baty and his committee for hosting a wonderfully organized event, the lovely hotel and an event that was a complete delight.

In response, John Baty recognized and thanked his outstanding committee, including Sue the judging co-ordinator and Shrawan Khanna for all their hard work. John commented that unlike *Survivor*, and other "reality" TV shows, "this is reality".

Carried with unanimous enthusiasm.

**5. Issues**

*a) Hybrid teams*

Prior to the National Championships, the Board of Governors received requests from British Columbia and Saskatchewan to consider allowing hybrid teams to be fully eligible for team awards. By email vote, the BOG upheld the current by-law 16 for this year's Championships.

However, the British Columbia parents further challenged the ruling by writing to one of DSABC's funders to express their dissatisfaction. John Baty referred this matter to the membership for consideration.

Provinces are free to select teams as they wish, which means their internal policies may be at odds with the National Championships By-laws. The CNDC was started in response to the

need for a national team event, with the emphasis being on teams from the same school, versus the National Seminar, which was an individual event where competitors had to be from different schools. For some provinces, hybrid teams are allowed so debaters have the opportunity to debate where the size, composition or lack of a club make school partnerships impossible. By-law 16 allows these debaters to still benefit from the experience.

After some discussion, and consideration of the fact that some provinces are willing to send hybrid teams with the understanding they are not eligible to advance to the quarter-finals, the membership agreed to keep the current by-law as is.

However, it was pointed out that the original intention was to allow individuals to be eligible for awards and it was suggested that the By-laws in fact contained an error.

**Tracey Lee/Linda Martin moved to amend the final half of the last sentence of Rule 16 to read “but they are eligible for individual awards”.**

Carried

Further, it was agreed upon by the membership that the wording of By-law 16 in effect prior to this decision will be used in determining winners, as it is unfair to make the change now, since some teams may have elected not to attend based on the original wording.

*b) Junior Nationals teams attending Senior Nationals*

The membership discussed the issue of grade 9 teams attending first the National Championships, then the Junior Nationals only a few weeks later. It was suggested that the experience creates an unfair playing field for the grade 7 and 8 teams at Junior Nationals. For some provinces, once a debater moves up a category they can not move back down. This same reasoning could apply in this situation.

The membership asked that this issue be raised at the coaches' meeting at Junior Nationals, as that is the more appropriate forum for making any decisions regarding eligibility for Junior Nationals.

*c) Bracketing*

The issue of bracketing after the first round was raised. The language of By-law 26 and 27 is open to some interpretation. As long as the conditions of By-law 26 are met (teams debate both sides of the prepared resolution and provincial protection is ensured) bracketing may begin after round 1.

The BOG had discussed by email the issue of breaking ties in the bracketing if teams should happen to have the same record and point total. It was decided if necessary, that the CA would drop the highest and lowest score of each team, then the next two scores if it became necessary.

**6. Upcoming National Championships Hosts and beyond**

Halifax will be hosting Nationals in April 2011, with a date to be determined that does not conflict with the Jewish holidays, and AP and IB exams.

Chris George is to be approached about the possibility of Montreal hosting in 2012. Further, a list of past hosts is to be circulated to the members to assist with the selection of a hosting year.

7. **2010 Oxford Cup (previously North Americans)**

The 2010 Oxford cup will be hosted by Upper Canada College November 27-28. It is recommended that judging be done by one experienced judge over the option of a panel of inexperienced judges.

The membership reviewed By-law 45 regarding the requirement that the two teams selected must be from different provinces. This rule was initially adopted to help build the popularity of the event among the members. Further, the event has become the qualifier to the Oxford Union Championships in Great Britain.

However, an issue arose last year when the second place team (who was from the same school as the first place team) was announced as being selected to attend, but were then informed of the rule that they were not eligible. The family challenged the selection, the Oxford Union organizers were contacted, and Canada was informed that By-law 45 was not their requirement, and that they in fact preferred that Canada send only the top two teams, as that is their regional criteria.

**Tracey Lee/Lorelie DeRoose moved in response to Oxford Union's request to remove "from different provinces" from rule 45.** Defeated.

Tracey Lee will convey the results of this discussion to the Oxford Union. If this decision proves unacceptable to the Oxford Union, the membership is to revisit the issue by email.

Further, hosts are to make it clear to attendees on the invitation of the policy that the top two teams must be from different provinces.

8. **2010 Team Canada try-outs report and beyond**

Martin Poirier, the acting Committee Chair, acknowledge and thanked the Committee members who were present for their work preparing for and running the try-outs just prior to the National Championships. The Committee has a short list, to be endorsed by all members of the committee, before they begin notifying the selected students. The Summer Camp will most likely be in Toronto, with the final 5 member/2 alternate 2011 Scotland team members to be decided at some point after the camp.

Coaches across Canada are encouraged to visit the Summer Camp and the try-outs, as the Committee's goal is to build coaching expertise so Canada can repeat this year's win.

The next worlds will be in South Africa in February 2012, so the try-outs for that team will occur in Toronto on November 29-30, following the Oxford Cup on the 27-28<sup>th</sup> at Upper Canada College. Members will again be invited to send 3 debaters. The process for selecting the "fill-in" debaters is still being refined, as there were some issues with the application/selection method, including how and to who the information was communicated to, and the perception of unfairness when debaters on members' waitlists were not selected in favour of those from the general application process.

John Robinson/seconded by all the membership unanimously congratulated the Canadian Team & Coach for their brilliant job winning, for the way Tracey Lee brought all together all 9 team members to be involved on the team to gain the experience, and for the amazing and successful funding efforts.

Tracey Lee commented that Team Canada represented a whole crew of people who made them successful – all alumni, coaches at school teams, parents, and colleagues on the Worlds committee. The support was massive, and the Team really felt they won it on behalf of our country because of the support. So often debate feels there is no structure, with isolated individual trying to keep debate alive – the win validates the hard work of everyone. This was truly a national team and national effort – what it takes to win a championship.

*At 11:15 am the meeting was recessed and reconvened at 9:05 am on Sunday Morning.*

**9. Varia**

*a) Judging next year*

The membership was polled on their preference for judging panels: 1 experienced judge, preferably experienced coaches over rooms of 3 inexperienced judges, with 3 experienced judges being the best option. The 2011 hosts will keep this in mind and provide an option on the registration form for coaches/adult delegates to indicate if they wish to judge.

*b) Open adjudication*

The membership agreed that open adjudication for the first two prepared rounds is acceptable as long as there is at least one experienced judge in each room to lead the discussion with constructive criticism. Further, the use of “speed ballots” was recommended to allow the tabbing process to proceed quickly, while the judges used the wait time to give fuller comments.

**10. Election of Board of Governors**

- ◆ Brian Casey, automatically on the board as Nationals Chair
- ◆ Michael Muir, to be on the contact list as Chair of the Oxford Cup, but not as a Governor
- ◆ John Robinson nominated by Lorelie/Tracey, accepts
- ◆ Josh Judah nominated by Linda/Greg, accepts
- ◆ Harold Kyte nominated by Brian/John R., accepts
- ◆ Lorelie DeRoose nominated by Katrine/Tracey, accepts
- ◆ Angela Fraser nominated by Lorelie/Tracey, accepts
- ◆ Chris George nominated by Greg/John R, to be contacted to confirm acceptance
  - ◆ *(Chris George has since accepted the nomination)*

Linda/Greg moved to close nominations. Carried.

**11. Adjournment**

John Robinson moved adjournment at 9:25 am. Carried.